

## **Liturgical Music Reform, Vatican II, and the American Roman Catholic Church**

The convocation of the Second Ecumenical Council of the Vatican was a pivotal moment for the Roman Catholic Church in a dialogue on church reform that began in the early sixteenth century. In conjunction with popular culture, the events leading up to the Second Vatican Council and those prior to each preceding major reform offer a glimpse into possible futures of the Roman Catholic Church and Christianity as a whole.<sup>1</sup> Prior to Vatican II, the Church dictated the musical elements of the Mass. With the Church's desire to enter into a dialogue with other denominations and faiths, a door was opened to allow popular culture into the Church and let individual congregations begin to dictate their own liturgical styles. Has this led to a church that allows popular culture to dictate liturgical styles? With the Vatican easing its "quality control" grip on liturgical art and music, are the days of proper liturgical music behind us?

This study seeks to answer these questions with a detailed look at the documents of Vatican II that specifically pertain to liturgy and music, the documents that preceded Vatican II, the history and events leading up to the reforms, and accounts and opinions of clergy, musicians, and critics who saw these reforms and adapted to them in the almost sixty years since the Second Vatican Council was convened. Sources included in my research encompass historical volumes which outline prior reforms and are comprised of perspectives of clergy, musicians, and lay people. As Vatican II was and remains a controversial topic, many of these sources exhibit certain biases; therefore, extra care was taken in the search for sources which cover a variety of sentiments toward the reforms.

---

<sup>1</sup> James F. White, *A Brief History of Christian Worship* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1993), p. 178.

## **I. A Brief History of Musical Reform in the Roman Catholic Church**

To understand the reforms and the necessity of such reforms, we must take a look at where the music and liturgy originate and how it progressed through almost two millennia. Within the ninety-two years between the First Vatican Council and the Second Vatican Council, the world experienced vast cultural shifts, necessitating a response from the world's religious leaders and the Roman Catholic Church. The Church's response at the Second Vatican Council was not only a response to these cultural shifts, but a continuation of dialogue on reform dating back to the fourteenth century. The most pivotal point of reform was the sixteenth century Protestant Reformation and the Roman Catholic Church's Counter-Reformation Movement, set in motion at the Council of Trent. Therefore, for the purposes of laying a foundation of liturgical and musical reform in the Roman Catholic Church, we will separate the history of Roman Catholic reform prior to Vatican I and II into three parts: pre-Tridentine reform, the Council of Trent, and post-Tridentine reform (specifically reforms of Pope Benedict XIV since they relate to music).

### **A. Pre-Tridentine Reform**

Christianity emerged as the “religion of the state” in the early fourth century, following the conversion of Emperor Constantine in 311 and the Edict of Milan in 313.<sup>2</sup> With Christianity now a legal religion throughout the Roman Empire, daily public prayer and the liturgy began to develop.<sup>3</sup> Evolving from Jewish Psalm-singing, chant played a major role in the liturgy of the Church. Commonly known as “Gregorian Chant,” this body of music is defined with five characteristics: (1) Liturgical—Music for the rites of the Church; (2) Vocal—It is sung; (3)

---

<sup>2</sup> Edward Schaeffer, *Catholic Music Through the Ages: Balancing the Needs of a Worshipping Church* (Chicago: Hillenbrand Books, 2008), p. 37.

<sup>3</sup> White, *A Brief History of Christian Worship*, p. 52.

Monophonic—There is no harmony, only a single melodic line; (4) Unaccompanied—No instrumental support; and (5) Rhythmically supple—The rhythm is determined by the spoken rhythm of the texts being sung.<sup>4</sup> Labeled as such in honor of Pope Gregory the Great (590-604) who was known to have a certain interest in the liturgy, Gregorian Chant is a term typically meant to describe the chant of the Roman Church, though other forms of chant existed throughout Church history. The Church has cultivated chant in the liturgy since its inception and has encouraged its progression and teaching through the centuries by way of such institutions as the *Schola Cantorum*, founded by Pope Gregory.<sup>5</sup> The preservation of this repertoire was greatly encouraged during the Carolingian era (c.751-987) by way of a desire for unification of the liturgy and chant practice under Charlemagne.<sup>6</sup> These desires for preservation led to advancements in notation and the development of polyphony.

Even in the wake of the Second Vatican Council, Chant continues to play a major role in the liturgy and is encouraged in the *Sacrosanctum Concilium*: “The Church acknowledges Gregorian chant as specially suited to the Roman liturgy: therefore, other things being equal, it should be given pride of place in liturgical services.”<sup>7</sup>

The advancements of the late Carolingian era and the subsequent centuries eventually led to a decline in chant; however, the period between the tenth to fourteenth centuries saw vast developments in polyphony which would arguably be the most blatant advancement affecting music in the Church.<sup>8</sup> The first written descriptions of polyphony in chant begin to emerge toward the end of the tenth century, with the first examples of *organum* appearing in an

---

<sup>4</sup> Willi Apel, *Gregorian Chant* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1990), p. 4.

<sup>5</sup> Edward Foley, *From Age to Age: How Christians Have Celebrated the Eucharist* (Collegeville: Liturgical Press, 2008), p. 99.

<sup>6</sup> Foley, *From Age to Age*, p. 101.

<sup>7</sup> Second Vatican Council, Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy, *Sacrosanctum Concilium* (December 4, 1963), ¶116.

<sup>8</sup> Schaeffer, *Catholic Music Through the Ages*, p. 40.

anonymous treatise called *Musica enchiriadis*.<sup>9</sup> The center of this compositional style was the Notre Dame School of Organum in Paris. As organum evolved, the mid-twelfth century introduces a new compositional form called the *motet*.

Regardless of perceived advancements, criticism of polyphonic music grew during this period as well. Chant was now used as compositional material, or a *cantus firmus*, for newly created tunes rather than remaining as the focal point of the music. Motets grew increasingly secular and were often written in French, decreasing its connection to the liturgy. These issues prompted dissatisfaction among the clergy, reaching a high point in the fourteenth century and demanding Papal response.<sup>10</sup> Among the Papal Bulls of Pope John XXII were the *Extravagantes communes*, containing *De vita et honestate clericorum*, and the *Docta Sanctorum*. These documents asserted the importance of chant in the liturgy, however condemning the use of *ars nova* techniques which obstructed the original chant melodies with their complexity; however, with the advancements of music and polyphony in the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries, this prohibition was largely ignored.

## **B. The Council of Trent (1545-1563)**

As the centuries progressed, the influences of secular music entered the repertory of liturgical music and eventually grew to be such a problem that the Church was faced with the challenge of removing inappropriate characteristics while not repressing the creativity which had produced so many of the greatest compositions to date. In the sixteenth century however, the Church was confronted with other necessary reforms outside of just music following Martin Luther's posting of his *95 Theses* in 1517. This necessitated the convocation of the pivotal Nineteenth Ecumenical Council, commonly known as the Council of Trent. Among the reforms

---

<sup>9</sup> Schaeffer, *Catholic Music Through the Ages*, p. 57.

<sup>10</sup> Robert F. Hayburn, *Papal Legislation on Sacred Music* (Harrison: Roman Catholic Books, 1979), p. 20.

deliberated at the Council of Trent was a report from Bishop Blancicampianus of Vienne, France, who discussed the need for musical reform in his 1543 report to the Council and Ecumenical Synod of Trent. Blancicampianus stated the problems in five points: (1) the incompetence of singers, (2) the lack of corrected musical books for the liturgies, (3) singers “do not. Have thoughts as to whether their efforts of singing may be a shout or a love-cry,” (4) singers “do not advert to the manner in which they read or sing in the Choir,” and (5) the permission in the churches of “songs and organ music which arouse wantonness rather than piety.”<sup>11</sup> The Council’s response came in the form of the *Decretum de Observandis et evitandis in celebration missae* (Decree Concerning Things to be Observed and Avoided in the Celebration of Mass), which states, “They shall also banish from the churches all such music which, whether by the organ or in the singing, contains things that are lascivious or impure; likewise all worldly conduct, vain and profane conversations, wandering around, noise and clamor, so that the house of God may be seen to be and may be truly called a house of prayer.”<sup>12</sup>

Irrespective of the counter-reformation attempts of the Council of Trent, the Roman Catholic Church would continue its efforts and consistently stand its ground in a place of condemnation of Protestant denominations for over four hundred years.

### **C. The Reforms of Benedict XIV (1740-1758)**

As compositional and performance styles changed between the Baroque era and the Classical era, the Church remained concerned with superfluous music, or music that removed focus from the rites it accompanied in favor of focus on itself.<sup>13</sup> Benedict XIV issues the *Annus qui*, in which he orders that “chant should be sung in unison and directed by a competent

---

<sup>11</sup> Hayburn, *Papal Legislation on Sacred Music*, p. 26.

<sup>12</sup> Schaeffer, *Catholic Music Through the Ages*, p. 57.

<sup>13</sup> Karl Gustav Fellerer, *The History of Catholic Church Music* (Baltimore: Helicon Press, 1961), p. 136.

director,” that organ accompaniment of chant should be conservative and not seem secular, and that the words of the chant should be clearly understood.<sup>14</sup> During the rise of opera and theatrical music, Benedict XIV sought to ensure that the music of the church and the music to be heard in the theater were distinguishable from one another.

## **II. The Roman Catholic Church in the Twentieth Century**

The nineteenth century brought on a renewed spirit of interest in the chant through the Gregorian Chant Revival and the Cecilian Movement, essentially striving to “acquaint Church musicians with the laws of the Church on sacred music.”<sup>15</sup> Many similar movements arose by the end of the nineteenth century. Likewise, several schools of musical development emerged, mostly influenced by secular genres more so than sacred.

### **A. Pius X (1903-1914), Benedict XV (1914-1922), and Pius XI (1922-1938)**

In the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, the Church faced ideological and theological challenges of secularism, liberalism, and modernism which continued to permeate its music. In 1903, Pope Pius X issued a *motu proprio* (a type of decree) entitled *Tra le sollecitudini*, which codified some principles that were set in motion by the Council of Trent, namely the placement of Gregorian chant as the preeminent style of music most suited to the Roman Liturgy and its “restoration to the use of the people.”<sup>16</sup> The document went further, condemning the use of anything secular in the liturgy, condemning the use of any instruments other than the organ, and reaffirming the requirement that music in the Mass strictly adhere to the use of liturgical Latin.

### **B. Pius XII (1939-1958)**

---

<sup>14</sup> *Sanctissimi Domini nostro Benedicti Papae XIV: Bullarium, editio nova*, 7:66-67, ¶9.

<sup>15</sup> Hayburn, *Papal Legislation on Sacred Music*, p. 115.

<sup>16</sup> Anthony Ruff, OSB, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform: Treasures and Transformations* (Chicago: Hillenbrand Books, 2007), pp. 210-211.

Pius XII sought to reinforce the reforms of Pius X while also recognizing the need for congregational participation, which required the relaxation of some restrictions imposed by Pius X. His continued reinforcement of these reforms are recorded in three documents: *Mediator Dei* (1947), *Musica sacra disciplina* (1955), and *De musica sacra et sacra liturgia* (1958).

The first document from Pius XII, the *Mediator Dei*, considers Gregorian chant as that “which the Roman Church considers her own as handed down from antiquity”<sup>17</sup> and expanded on directions for active congregational participation in worship. Less than a decade later, the *Musica sacra disciplina* begins to allow some flexibility in some of the reforms of Pius X, most notably the admission of musical instruments other than the organ and the use of popular hymns during worship. Before his death, Pius XII issued the *De musica sacra et sacra liturgia*, which furthered congregational participation in three degrees, which were based on the liturgical feast or fast being celebrated: (1) congregational singing of “Amen” to all orations and singing various other responses, (2) participation in the Ordinary parts of the mass, and (3) participation in the Proper chants of the mass, specifically by those proficient in singing the chant.<sup>18</sup>

### C. Response to the Papal Decrees of the Twentieth Century

The *Tra le sollecitudini* of Pius X advanced the chant restoration efforts of the nineteenth century with its call to restore those melodies to congregational participation. With this legislation came various forms of chant “curriculum” in Catholic schools in the United States and Europe. Justine Ward, a teacher at the Sisters College of The Catholic University of America, developed the *Ward Method* for the musical education of school children based on Gregorian Chant.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> Hayburn, *Papal Legislation on Sacred Music*, p. 340.

<sup>18</sup> Ruff, OSB, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform*, p. 308.

<sup>19</sup> Karl Gustav Fellerer, *The History of Catholic Church Music* (Baltimore: Helicon Press, 1961), p. 198.

With the renewed attention that Gregorian chant received in the early twentieth century came much dedication to “purifying” the repertoire, purging the extravagances of the nineteenth century in favor of the Palestrina-esque purity. *The White List of the Society of St. Gregory of America* was first published in 1919, with revisions in 1938 and 1939. This list contained a selection of documents from Pius X and Pius XI, a list of music that was deemed appropriate for use in worship (according to the Society of St. Gregory), and a *Black List* of music deemed inappropriate for use in worship.

Response to the musical reforms of Pius X also led to the publication of numerous hymnals, especially in the United States, which until this point, had largely been a fixture of Protestant denominations more so than the Roman Catholic Church. While congregational participation in Mass was not necessarily discouraged, this was one of the first obvious signs of its encouragement. Between the publication of the *St. Basil Hymnal* in 1889 and *The Pius X Hymnal* in 1953, hymns in English began to slowly make their way into these hymnals, which reflects a gradual increase in the use of vernacular texts in the Mass and ecclesiastical approval of such uses, leading up to the Second Vatican Council.

#### **D. Cultural Changes in the Aftermath of WWII**

As to be expected, World War II nearly brought the reform movement to a halt in the United States; however, the years of peace following the war revived those movements. The Catholic University of America (Washington, DC), DePaul University (Chicago), and Alverno College (Milwaukee) were among the first institutes of higher education to establish formal degree programs in Church music.<sup>20</sup> As the twentieth century progressed, many Roman Catholics grew more accepting of contemporary developments. By the late 1950s, tensions between the

---

<sup>20</sup> Fellerer, *The History of Catholic Church Music*, p. 210.



Cecilian advocates and those in favor of modern acceptance reached a point which seemed to offer no compromise. Traditional musicians saw choirs, Gregorian chant, and Latin in the liturgy as foundations of reform while liturgists saw these elements as a deterrent to congregational participation.<sup>21</sup>

### **III. The Second Ecumenical Council of the Vatican**

On the surface, it may seem that the Second Ecumenical Council was convened to address only matters of liturgy and music; however, these were only two of the wide range of issues brought to the council. Worldwide scientific and technological advancement signaled the dawn of a new age of human thought and development. This also brought about a fear of worldwide destruction due to advancement in war technology and diplomatic concerns between the world's great military powers. Changes in music and liturgy must be viewed in the context of these worldwide issues. Religious institutions, including the Roman Catholic Church, were forced to publicly address these matters. Since the First Ecumenical Council, the Church had intentionally sought to restore chant, improve the quality of liturgical music, and to involve the congregations in the musical life of the church.<sup>22</sup> Leaders of the Church sought not to be a part of the modern culture as much as to offer a beacon of hope in a world that was growing more secular. Church leaders wanted the Church to be "in the world, but not of the world." This was just as much the case for the music and liturgy as it was for any other aspect of the Church.

#### **A. The Sixteen Documents of Vatican II**

Between 1962 and 1965, the Holy See produced sixteen documents under the Second Ecumenical Council of the Vatican. These sixteen documents included four constitutions, nine decrees, and three declarations. The four constitutions consisted of two dogmatic and two

---

<sup>21</sup> Fellerer, *The History of Catholic Church Music*, p. 218.

<sup>22</sup> White, *A Brief History of Christian Worship*, p. 173.

pastoral constitutions. The *Lumen Gentium* (Dogmatic Constitution of the Church, 1964) reaffirms the place of the clergy and laity within the community of faith. The *Dei Verbum* (Dogmatic Constitution on Divine Revelation, 1965) addresses the Church's beliefs on sacred scripture as a basis for the Faith. The *Sacrosanctum Concilium* (Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy, 1963) addresses the proclamation of the Gospel through word and sacrament and expresses the need for intelligible proclamation. Finally, the *Gaudium et Spes* (Pastoral Constitution on the Church in the Modern World, 1965) addresses the manner in which the Church proceeds through a new, predominately secular era. Throughout the deliberations of Vatican II, another 12 smaller documents were produced in the form of decrees and declarations. These documents were formal statements from the Holy See on the Church's stance on issues related to inter-denominational and inter-faith dialogue, the work of the laity, Christian education, and religious freedom.<sup>23</sup>

### **B. *Sacrosanctum Concilium***

The *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, or the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy, solemnly promulgated by Pope Paul VI on December 4, 1963, was the document which addressed liturgical reform and the music of the Church. While reiterating many of the insights of Pius X on the importance of music in the liturgy, this document incited the most significant and radical change in the way Roman Catholic Church has worshipped since the Council of Trent.<sup>24</sup> In general, this constitution clarified liturgical principles, encouraged liturgical instruction, advocated for the active participation of congregations, and reformed the methods of worship.

---

<sup>23</sup> Second Vatican Ecumenical Council, *The Documents of Vatican II* (Strathfield: ST PAULS PUBLICATIONS, 2009), p. 1.

<sup>24</sup> Foley, *From Age to Age*, p. 326.

The sixth chapter of the *Sacrosanctum Concilium* is concerned specifically with the music of the Church. Here, the congregations are encouraged to take part in the Mass in the first paragraph:

¶113. *Liturgical worship is given a more noble form when the divine offices are celebrated solemnly in song, with the assistance of sacred ministers and the active participation of the people.*<sup>25</sup>

The full chapter discusses the importance of the cultivation of inherently Roman Catholic music and the prominence of music traditions within the Church, specifically those of Gregorian Chant. Paragraphs 114 and 115 stress the importance of the cultivation and proper instruction of music for choirs and clergy, and further rest the responsibility of oversight on the respective diocesan bishops. Paragraphs 116 and 117 discuss the importance of the restoration of Gregorian chant to its former place of prominence in the Roman Liturgy and calls for the publication of this repertory in the form of books and printed form to ensure their longevity. Paragraph 118 reiterates the idea of congregational participation in the music; however, it does so in a much more direct form by also giving somewhat vague instruction as to how it should be done.

By far, some of the most radical statements of this constitution can be found in paragraphs 119 to 121. These some of the subjects discussed were already being allowed in certain parts of the world, this would be the first official statement of consent and encouragement from the Vatican for such profound change. Paragraph 119 essentially allows musical styles from all over the world to be used in worship:

¶119. *In certain parts of the world, especially mission lands, there are peoples who have their own musical traditions, and these play a great part in their religious and social life. For this reason due importance is to be attached to their music, and a suitable place is to be given to it, not only in forming their attitude toward religion, but also in adapting worship to their native genius.*<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>25</sup> Second Vatican Ecumenical Council, *The Documents of Vatican II*, p. 117.

<sup>26</sup> Second Vatican Ecumenical Council, *The Documents of Vatican II*, pp. 117-118.

Paragraph 120 expresses the importance of the pipe organ in the Latin Church, yet goes further to encourage the use of instruments beyond those traditionally played in church. Unlike similar documents which came before this one, it only suggests that “suitable” instruments should be used rather than naming specific instruments deemed appropriate or inappropriate:

¶120. *...but other instruments also may be admitted for use in divine worship, with the knowledge and consent of the competent territorial authority...only on condition that the instruments are suitable, or can be made suitable, for sacred use, accord with the dignity of the temple, and truly contribute to the edification of the faithful.*<sup>27</sup>

Paragraph 121 encourages composers to write with the new reforms in mind, including the use of the vernacular and the conformity with Catholic doctrine. Again, specific instructions were lacking in this paragraph. The vague verbiage used in this chapter of the *Sacrosanctum Concilium* would lead to quite a bit of confusion and experimentation among musicians over the following years, calling for clarification from the Holy See only two years after Vatican II was closed.

#### **IV. Music in the Roman Catholic Church Beyond Vatican II**

“The Sixties,” as opposed to the literal decade of the 1960s, can be defined as a cultural revolution which opposed the drawing of lines between high culture and popular culture, approximately between the years 1952 and 1973.<sup>28</sup> In conjunction with the Second Vatican Council, this movement, championed by the newly created music genre “rock and roll” and driven by the commercial availability of the television, demanded immediate change in liturgical, doctrinal, and theological concepts and brought many of these issues into every American home and parish. By default, popular culture would now begin to infiltrate the Church’s sanctuary of tradition.

---

<sup>27</sup> Second Vatican Ecumenical Council, *The Documents of Vatican II*, p. 118.

<sup>28</sup> Ken Meyers, *All God’s Children & Blue Suede Shoes: Christians and Popular Culture* (Wheaton: Crossway, 1989), p. 104.

### A. Abrupt Reactions to Liturgical Reform

While some aspects of worship changed immediately after the promulgation of the *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, it would take a short time before Mass would be chanted or sung in vernacular languages. Many churches already had hymnals or volumes of music in their own languages, but these did not include music for parts of the Mass which were reserved for Latin. Most of this period was simply waiting for clarification on the reforms of Vatican II.

Among the immediate changes of the Second Vatican Council was the first *Instruction on Implementing the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* in 1964, which mandated the movement of the altar table to a free-standing position so the Eucharist would be celebrated *versus populum* (facing the people) from the other side of the altar.<sup>29</sup> This was symbolic of the newly ordered level of involvement of the people in the liturgy of the Church.

### B. *Musicam Sacram*

On March 5, 1967, the Sacred Congregation for Divine Worship issued the *Musicam Sacram*.<sup>30</sup> This document offered detailed instruction and specificity to the principles issued in the *Sacrosanctum Concilium*. This document framed the Vatican II reforms as a continuation of the reforms of Pius X and his predecessors rather than a complete disregard for traditions within the Church. Because of this, the *Musicam Sacram* followed the same general outline used in the 1958 *De musica sacra et sacra liturgia* of Pope John XXIII. Thus, three “degrees” of participation were offered, instructing congregations on how they should participate in worship.<sup>31</sup>

### C. The Mass of Paul VI

---

<sup>29</sup> White, *A Brief History of Christian Worship*, p. 176.

<sup>30</sup> Second Vatican Ecumenical Council, “*Musicam Sacram*.” *The Holy See*. Accessed January 26, 2021. <http://www.vatican.va/>

<sup>31</sup> Ruff, OSB, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform*, p. 342.

The reforms of Vatican II would certainly require an order of the Mass which would encourage participation, encourage the composition of new music, and allow for the use of the vernacular. The *Mass of Paul VI*, commonly referred to as the *post-Vatican II Mass*, was the form of the Mass promulgated in 1969 by Pope Paul VI. This Mass was first published in the Roman Missal in 1970 and has undergone a few revisions by each subsequent Pope since Paul VI, yet remains in use worldwide today. It derives from its preceding *Tridentine Mass*, which was in use for almost four hundred years.

#### **D. The Modern Evolution of Roman Catholic Music**

While the constitutions and decrees may seem to dictate a strict outline for acceptable music in the Mass, the evolution of sacred music and liturgy since the 1960s has all but proven that nothing is completely off limits. The Second Vatican Council destroyed the myth that the Mass was some trans-historical and unchangeable rite. This led to “folk Masses” by the late 1960s which would consist of simple music in a popular style, played by amateurs with guitars. This was the beginning of the “praise chorus” as well, which sought to involve congregations in the singing of simple texts and melodies through memorization and repetition.

Music in and for the Church began to resemble that of popular culture in not only its styles, but in the forms it took on for mass consumption. The 1960s and 1970s saw an influx of “bands” and performing groups, such as The DAMEANS and the St. Louis Jesuits. Lines between worship music and the secular music industry began to blur. This was evidenced by “crossover artists” who could move seamlessly between the sanctuary and the Billboard Top 100.<sup>32</sup> This music was not only performed in worship services but had permeated mainstream and popular culture avenues, sparking concerns of distinguishability between music for worship and music

---

<sup>32</sup> Foley, *From Age to Age*, p. 330.

for entertainment. Many of these works, such as *Here I Am, Lord, One Bread, One Body*, and *Be Not Afraid* can be found in modern hymnals across multiple denominations.

In the 1980s, Marty Haugen joined the ranks of popular Roman Catholic Composers. He remains in the top echelon with his *Mass of Creation*, which is still in wide use throughout the United States.<sup>33</sup> Haugen is a prime example of the direction by which Roman Catholic music has progressed since Vatican II. In the earlier years of his career, continued to refer simply to scripture for his texts just as the St. Louis Jesuits had done; though as the years progressed and we entered the new millennium, Haugen's work began to show a new freedom within his texts and a movement away from direct biblical text. This has posed quite a few theological concerns amongst Catholics.

#### V. Continuity of Roman Catholic Music

Among the theological concerns brought about by the liturgical music of such composers as Marty Haugen are new ideas which had not been present in the music, liturgy, or scripture before Vatican II. Much music of today, such as Haugen's *Gather Us In*, speaks a message which places much focus on the assembly rather than on God, sparking theological controversy among Christian leaders. Many believe the "theology of the assembly" pulls the focus from God and on the assembly, while many also believe that "God can be found within the assembly." Liturgical music has undergone many changes in response to concerns of congregational approachability, cultural diversity, and fluctuating understandings of the function of music in worship.<sup>34</sup>

The continuity of music in the Roman Catholic Church will depend largely on the future of the general Christian Church and how it will navigate this new melding of high and traditional

---

<sup>33</sup> Schaeffer, *Catholic Music Through the Ages*, p. 153.

<sup>34</sup> Foley, *From Age to Age*, p. 330.

culture with popular culture.<sup>35</sup> In the two thousand-year history of Christianity, we have watched a single Christian Church split through reform into a Roman Catholic tradition and many Protestant traditions, many of these traditions founded through assimilation into their respective regional cultures.<sup>36</sup> The worldwide Christian faith will continue to evolve through cultural shifts, necessitating more reform in generations to come. Even in the twenty-first century, the Roman Catholic Church continues to discuss deliberations of the Second Vatican Council, calling for clarification from the Vatican and possibly for further reform.

---

<sup>35</sup> Meyers, *All God's Children and Blue Suede Shoes*, p. 180.

<sup>36</sup> White, *A Brief History of Christian Worship*, p. 179.



### Works Cited

- Apel, Willi. *Gregorian Chant*. Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1990.
- Bulman, Raymond F., and Frederick J. Parrella, Eds. *From Trent to Vatican II: Historical and Theological Investigations*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Day, Thomas. *Why Catholics Can't Sing*. New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 2013.
- Eden, Bradford Lee. "The Sounds of Vatican II: Musical Change and Experimentation in Two Trappist Monasteries, 1965–1984." *U.S. Catholic Historian* 32 (2014): 77-97.
- Fellerer, Karl Gustav. *The History of Catholic Church Music*. Baltimore: Helicon Press, 1961.
- Foley, Edward. *From Age to Age: How Christians Have Celebrated the Eucharist*. Collegeville: Liturgical Press, 2008.
- Hayburn, Robert F. *Papal Legislation on Sacred Music*. Harrison: Roman Catholic Books, 1979.
- Myers, Ken. *All God's Children & Blue Suede Shoes: Christians and Popular Culture*. Wheaton: Crossway, 1989.
- Overath, Johannes, ed. *Sacred Music and Liturgy Reform After Vatican II*. Saint Paul: North Central Publishing Company, 1969.
- Ruff, Anthony, OSB. *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform: Treasures and Transformations*. Chicago: Hillenbrand Books, 2007.
- Schaefer, Edward. *Catholic Music Through the Ages: Balancing the Needs of a Worshipping Church*. Chicago: Hillenbrand Books, 2008.
- Second Vatican Ecumenical Council. "Musicam Sacram: Instruction on Music in the Liturgy." *The Holy See*. Accessed January 26, 2021.  
[http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist\\_councils/ii\\_vatican\\_council/documents/vat-ii\\_instr\\_19670305\\_musicam-sacram\\_en.html](http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_instr_19670305_musicam-sacram_en.html)
- Second Vatican Ecumenical Council. *The Documents of Vatican II*. Strathfield: ST PAULS PUBLICATIONS, 2009.
- Tucker, Jeffrey A. *Sing Like a Catholic*. Richmond: Church Music Association of America, 2009.
- White, James F. *A Brief History of Christian Worship*. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1993.